

CHAPTER 9

**Education and Manpower Bureau
Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
Home Affairs Bureau
Home Affairs Department
Housing Department**

**The Government's efforts in getting
the community involved to keep Hong Kong clean**

**Audit Commission
Hong Kong
22 October 2005**

This audit review was carried out under a set of guidelines tabled in the Provisional Legislative Council by the Chairman of the Public Accounts Committee on 11 February 1998. The guidelines were agreed between the Public Accounts Committee and the Director of Audit and accepted by the Government of the Hong Kong Special Administrative Region.

Report No. 45 of the Director of Audit contains 9 Chapters which are available on our website at <http://www.aud.gov.hk>.

Audit Commission
26th floor, Immigration Tower
7 Gloucester Road
Wan Chai
Hong Kong

Tel : (852) 2829 4210
Fax : (852) 2824 2087
E-mail : enquiry@aud.gov.hk

THE GOVERNMENT'S EFFORTS IN GETTING THE COMMUNITY INVOLVED TO KEEP HONG KONG CLEAN

Contents

	Paragraph
PART 1: INTRODUCTION	1.1
Background	1.2
Clean-up efforts before 2000	1.3 – 1.4
Clean-up efforts since 2000	1.5 – 1.11
Audit review	1.12 – 1.14
Acknowledgement	1.15
PART 2: COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT AT THE DISTRICT LEVEL	2.1
Building community ownership	2.2
District Hygiene Squads	2.3
<i>Audit observations</i>	2.4 – 2.8
<i>Audit recommendations</i>	2.9
Response from the Administration	2.10
Blackspot monitoring scheme: closed-circuit televisions	2.11 – 2.14
<i>Audit observations</i>	2.15 – 2.20
<i>Audit recommendations</i>	2.21
Response from the Administration	2.22 – 2.23
Coordinating role of the Home Affairs Department	2.24
<i>Audit observations</i>	2.25
<i>Audit recommendations</i>	2.26
Response from the Administration	2.27

	Paragraph
PART 3: COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT IN PUBLIC HOUSING ESTATES	3.1
Estate Drainage Ambassadors Scheme	3.2 – 3.3
<i>Audit observations</i>	3.4 – 3.8
<i>Audit recommendations</i>	3.9
Response from the Administration	3.10 – 3.11
Public Housing Estate Cleanliness Incentive Scheme	3.12 – 3.14
<i>Audit observations</i>	3.15 – 3.19
<i>Audit recommendations</i>	3.20
Response from the Administration	3.21
Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme	3.22 – 3.24
<i>Audit observations</i>	3.25 – 3.26
<i>Audit recommendations</i>	3.27
Response from the Administration	3.28
 PART 4: CIVIC AND HEALTH EDUCATION	 4.1
Civic and health education in schools	4.2 – 4.28
<i>Audit observations</i>	4.29 – 4.31
<i>Audit recommendations</i>	4.32
Response from the Administration	4.33
Civic and health education outside schools	4.34 – 4.35
<i>Audit observations</i>	4.36 – 4.44
<i>Audit recommendations</i>	4.45
Response from the Administration	4.46 – 4.47

	Page
Appendices	
A : Major activities of Keep Hong Kong Clean Campaign from 1970 to 1999	53 – 54
B : Community participation in the closed-circuit television pilot project (November 2003 to March 2005)	55
C : Cleansing exercises in the public housing estates (January 2004 to March 2005)	56
D : Participation of Estate Management Advisory Committees and non-government organisations in cleansing exercises in the public housing estates (January 2004 to March 2005)	57
E : Participation of local residents and volunteers in cleansing exercises in the public housing estates (January 2004 to March 2005)	58
F : The Hong Kong Healthy Schools Award Scheme	59 – 60
G : Civic and health education programmes organised by District Offices (August 2003 to March 2005)	61
H : Acronyms and abbreviations	62

PART 1: INTRODUCTION

1.1 This PART describes the background to the audit of the Government's efforts to keep Hong Kong clean.

Background

1.2 The Government's efforts to keep Hong Kong clean have a long history. The first clean-up operation was launched in 1948. Since then, various activities have been organised. To a certain extent, these activities have brought about a cleaner environment and increased civic-mindedness, especially among the young.

Clean-up efforts before 2000

Clean Hong Kong Campaign

1.3 Under the Clean Hong Kong Campaign, a two-week clean-up operation was carried out across the territory each year from 1948 to 1954. Miss Ping On, a highly popular figure introduced as the symbol of the campaign, was used to urge the public to pay attention to household cleanliness, prevent breeding of mosquitoes and wash their hands before eating. From 1965 to 1969, a series of district clean-up operations were also carried out.

Keep Hong Kong Clean Campaign

1.4 In 1970, the Keep Hong Kong Clean Campaign Committee was set up. The campaign's publicity and educational activities officially commenced in August 1972. A number of mascots, including the Litter Bug ("Lap Sap Chung"), were created to mark the commencement of the Keep Hong Kong Clean Campaign. A summary of the major activities of the Keep Hong Kong Clean Campaign from 1970 to 1999 is given in Appendix A.

Clean-up efforts since 2000

Launching of Clean Hong Kong Programme in 2000

1.5 In his 2000 Policy Address, the Chief Executive announced the launching of a three-year "Clean Hong Kong Programme" in December 2000. The objectives of the programme were to bring about visible and sustainable improvements to the environment through active cleansing operations, public education and publicity efforts, and instil a sense of belonging and pride in the community for a clean environment. A Steering Committee

on Clean Hong Kong was set up to oversee the overall planning of the programme. A Clean Hong Kong Office was set up in the Food and Environmental Hygiene Department (FEHD) to provide support to the Steering Committee on Clean Hong Kong.

1.6 District Clean Hong Kong Committees (DCHKCs), chaired by the Vice-chairmen of the respective District Councils (DCs), were set up in 2000 in all the 18 districts to promote and disseminate the Clean Hong Kong messages. Through the District Councils Subsidy Scheme, subsidies were granted for activities organised by the DCHKCs at the district level. From 1 January 2001 to 31 December 2003, over 1,600 voluntary Clean Hong Kong Ambassadors were recruited through the District Offices (DOs). The Clean Hong Kong Funding Scheme of the FEHD provided funding support for various organisations to hold Clean Hong Kong promotional activities and organise community involvement programmes for public participation.

Setting up of Team Clean in 2003

1.7 The outbreak of the Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome (SARS) in March 2003 aroused great public concern over environmental hygiene. On 5 May 2003, the Chief Executive announced the setting up of Team Clean (Note 1), chaired by the Chief Secretary for Administration, to develop and take forward proposals for entrenching a high level of public and environmental hygiene in Hong Kong.

Strategies adopted by Team Clean

1.8 Team Clean considered that although previous clean-up efforts had resulted in cleaner streets in some parts of Hong Kong, they did not develop into sustained efforts or results across the community because:

- (a) the focus of the campaigns was on cleansing and soft promotion;
- (b) community ownership was not a central feature; and
- (c) there was no sustainable structure to enable efforts to continue beyond the original campaigns.

Note 1: *The terms of reference of Team Clean were, among others, to develop a coherent system and strategy for integrating and augmenting environmental hygiene improvement initiatives across all concerned government bureaux and departments, and determine the relative priorities of areas targeted for improvement action, marshalling as much as possible wider community support, particularly that of the DCs and the non-government organisations to help tackle these areas.*

1.9 Team Clean's mission, therefore, was to establish and promote a sustainable, cross-sectoral approach to improve environmental hygiene in Hong Kong. Team Clean adopted the following two main strategies in devising its programme:

- (a) ***Developing sustainable systems.*** Sustainability would be the key to success. All improvement initiatives should be sustainable. One-off campaigns would achieve some success but these were limited and the effects short-lived. To keep Hong Kong clean for good, it would be necessary to address deep-rooted problems, blend civic education with harsher penalties and develop systems to sustain the efforts; and
- (b) ***Getting the community involved.*** The hygiene and cleanliness of a city could only be maintained with the support of its people. Community participation would be essential in all stages of Team Clean's exercises, and everyone would have an important role to play. It would be necessary to mobilise the whole community, harness their energies and tap their resources. The whole community, including the DCs, the Area Committees (ACs), the DCHKCs, schools and academics, professional groups, the business sector, social services groups and other non-government organisations (NGOs), volunteers, the mass media and members of the public, should be involved.

1.10 On 28 May 2003, Team Clean issued its "Interim Report on Measures to Improve Environmental Hygiene in Hong Kong". The interim report recommended more than 70 short-term measures for Phase I implementation, and more than 40 other longer-term measures for examination and consideration in Phase II. From June to July 2003, the short-term measures were implemented with good results (such as inspections of drains in private buildings and public housing estates (PHEs), enhanced enforcement against illegal cooked-food hawking in PHEs, clearance of environmental blackspots, prevention of dengue fever, improved hygiene standard in public places and empowerment of district administration). An opinion survey conducted in mid-July 2003 revealed that 91% of the respondents considered Hong Kong was cleaner than before.

1.11 On 9 August 2003, Team Clean published its final report "Report on Measures to Improve Environmental Hygiene in Hong Kong". The report put forward longer-term and sustainable measures on a number of areas under the categories of personal, home and community hygiene. Government bureaux and departments were tasked to develop sustainable systems to sustain Team Clean's intensive efforts. After the dissolution of Team Clean on 31 August 2003, institutional arrangements were made to facilitate the implementation of Team Clean's measures, monitor and give effect to interdepartmental coordination and maintain momentum in the community. The Steering Committee on Team Clean Follow Up (the Steering Committee), chaired by the Secretary for Home Affairs, was established in November 2003 to follow up on all Team Clean's proposed measures. The Home Affairs Department (HAD) plays a central coordinating role for interdepartmental

efforts in district hygiene improvement, as well as community involvement and civic education.

Audit review

1.12 A sustainable and integrated approach to environmental hygiene improvement with a high degree of community involvement is likely to keep Hong Kong clean for good. Against this background, the Audit Commission (Audit) has recently conducted a review of the extent of success of the Government's efforts to keep Hong Kong clean. Since this is a broad subject, the scope of this audit review is divided into two topics. The audit findings are contained in two separate reports as follows:

- (a) the Government's efforts in getting the community involved to keep Hong Kong clean (the subject matter of this report); and
- (b) the Government's efforts in developing sustainable systems to keep Hong Kong clean (see Chapter 8 of the Director of Audit's Report No. 45).

1.13 The focus of this report is on the following areas:

- (a) community involvement at the district level (PART 2);
- (b) community involvement in public housing estates (PART 3); and
- (c) civic and health education (PART 4).

1.14 In carrying out the audit review, Audit examined the records and interviewed the staff of various government bureaux and departments. Audit has found that good progress has been made to keep Hong Kong clean. Notwithstanding this, there is room for further improvement. Audit has made a number of recommendations to address the issues.

Acknowledgement

1.15 Audit would like to acknowledge with gratitude the full cooperation of the staff of the FEHD, the HAD, the Housing Department (HD), the Education and Manpower Bureau (EMB), and the Home Affairs Bureau (HAB) during the course of the audit review.

PART 2: COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT AT THE DISTRICT LEVEL

2.1 This PART examines the various community involvement initiatives taken by the HAD at the district level to improve environmental hygiene in Hong Kong, reports the achievements and suggests measures for further improvement.

Building community ownership

2.2 To make Hong Kong a truly clean city is a mission not only for the Government, but also for every member of the community. Students, parents, teachers, domestic helpers, restaurateurs and workers, storekeepers, tenants and landlords, building management companies, professional groups, the mass media, as well as district and community groups (such as DCs, ACs, Owners' Corporations (OCs), Mutual Aid Committees (MACs) and NGOs) should have important roles to play. Team Clean considered that the biggest challenge ahead was not the development of new policies or measures to mitigate environmental hygiene problems, but rather, the formulation of effective ways to promote civic responsibility and inculcate a genuine commitment by society at large. Measures would be developed to boost collaboration between the Government and the community in improving district hygiene. The aim was to bring about community ownership and a sense of collective pride.

District Hygiene Squads

2.3 The 18 DOs established District Hygiene Squads (DHS) by recruiting volunteers from local groups, including DCs, ACs, OCs, MACs and NGOs. Pursuant to Team Clean's recommendations in its final report, squad members should be given duties to inspect the hygiene conditions of the districts, identify problematic sites for follow-up actions, monitor progress of remedial work and help disseminate Team Clean messages. The DOs and the relevant government departments would work closely with the DHS and provide the necessary steer and support.

Audit observations

Need to enhance efforts in getting the community involved

2.4 The HAD maintained monthly progress reports consolidating information about the DHS members recruited by the 18 DOs. As shown in Table 1, Audit noted that:

- (a) as at 31 March 2005, the number of DHS members varied considerably among the 18 districts, ranging from 1,614 members in Sha Tin to 18 members in Yuen Long; and
- (b) the total number of DHS members increased by 467 (12%) from 3,869 members in April 2004 (Note 2) to 4,336 members in March 2005. The increase was mainly attributable to the recruitment of 374 new members in Sha Tin and 129 new members in Tai Po. Some DOs did not recruit any new members during the period from April 2004 to March 2005.

Note 2: *With effect from April 2004, the 18 DOs were required to provide the cumulative number of DHS members at the end of each month.*

Table 1
Increase/decrease in the number of DHS members
for the period from April 2004 to March 2005

District	Number of members (Note 1)		Increase/(decrease)
	as at 30 April 2004	as at 31 March 2005	
	(a)	(b)	(c) = (b) - (a)
Sha Tin	1,240	1,614	374
Tai Po	686	815	129
Sai Kung	455	464	9
Sham Shui Po	192	192	0
Kwai Tsing	188	188	0
Kwun Tong	171	172	1
Central & Western	168	167	(1)
Islands	103	130	27
Southern	93	110	17
Tuen Mun	264	104	(160) (Note 2)
Yau Tsim Mong	48	93	45
North	84	93	9
Wong Tai Sin	61	64	3
Tsuen Wan	28	32	4
Wan Chai	16	30	14
Eastern	34	30	(4)
Kowloon City	20	20	0
Yuen Long	18	18	0
Total	<u>3,869</u>	<u>4,336</u>	<u>467</u>

Source: HAD records

Note 1: The 18 DOs were not required to provide the cumulative number of DHS members prior to April 2004.

Note 2: In July 2004, the number of DHS members in Tuen Mun decreased significantly from 264 to 98 because inactive Clean Hong Kong Ambassadors ceased to be DHS members.

2.5 An audit survey on the DHS of the 18 districts revealed that, in addition to recruiting volunteers from DCHKCs, ACs, OCs, MACs and NGOs as recommended by Team Clean, some DOs (notably Sha Tin, Tai Po, Sai Kung, Sham Shui Po and Islands) recruited teachers, students, and volunteers from villages and other local organisations as DHS members. Audit notes that the participation of local volunteers, especially young people, in the DHS is in itself civic education in community involvement and social responsibility, and encourages other people to participate in similar activities. **As these DOs have, to a larger extent, got the community involved in the DHS, there is a need for the other DOs, particularly those which have not recruited any new members for some time, to consider expanding their DHS membership by recruiting more volunteers from the local community, especially from schools.**

Need to develop more meaningful management information

2.6 Audit found that, in reporting the number of inspections on hygiene conditions conducted by the DHS each month, the 18 DOs adopted different bases of counting the number of inspections. The number of DHS inspections of each of the 18 districts, though prepared on different bases, were added to give the total number of DHS inspections in the consolidated monthly progress report (i.e. 4,925 inspections for the period from April 2004 to March 2005). Details are shown in Table 2.

Table 2

**Total number of DHS inspections reported
for the period from April 2004 to March 2005**

District	Number of inspections	Basis of counting the number of inspections
Eastern	2,179	Number of spots/sites
Sha Tin	1,882	4 inspections per squad per month
Tai Po	203	Inspection reports of squads and month-end inspections (Note)
Southern	189	Number of operations by each squad
Kowloon City	101	Number of operations initiated by squads and month-end inspections
North	92	Number of operations
Central & Western	65	Number of operations
Wong Tai Sin	49	Number of operations
Tuen Mun	34	Number of operations
Yau Tsim Mong	22	Number of operations
Islands	17	Number of inspections by squad members
Kwai Tsing	17	Number of operations
Kwun Tong	17	Number of operations
Tsuen Wan	17	Number of operations
Sham Shui Po	12	Number of operations
Yuen Long	12	Number of operations
Wan Chai	9	Number of operations
Sai Kung	8	Number of operations
Total	<u>4,925</u>	

Source: Audit survey results

Note: All the 18 districts conducted inspections of hygiene blackspots during the last week of every month.

2.7 **Audit considers that, without a standardised and consistent basis of counting the number of inspections, the HAD could not provide reliable management information to the Steering Committee for monitoring the performance of the DHS in the 18 districts (Note 3). The HAD needs to establish a standardised and consistent basis of counting the number of DHS inspections, and devise more meaningful performance indicators for monitoring the extent of DHS members' participation in community hygiene activities.** For example, the number of members participating in community hygiene activities and their hours of participation in these activities should be included as performance indicators for measuring the extent of community involvement.

2.8 For the 12 districts reporting the number of DHS inspections conducted on the basis of the number of operations, there was a significant variance, ranging from 92 inspections in North District to 8 inspections in Sai Kung District for the period from April 2004 to March 2005 (see Table 2 in para. 2.6). Audit appreciates that each DO may organise inspections according to the particular circumstances of the district. **Audit considers that it is desirable to arrange more community hygiene activities and invite more DHS members to participate in these activities with a view to maintaining the momentum of the community involvement initiatives.**

Audit recommendations

- 2.9 **Audit has recommended that the Director of Home Affairs should:**
- (a) **encourage the DOs, particularly those which have not recruited any new DHS members for some time, to consider recruiting more DHS members from the local community to widen the community involvement at the district level;**
 - (b) **establish a standardised and consistent basis of counting the number of DHS inspections to provide reliable management information on the performance of the DHS in the 18 districts;**
 - (c) **develop meaningful performance indicators, including the number of DHS members and the time they have spent on community hygiene activities, for monitoring the extent of community involvement at the district level;**

Note 3: *Hygiene problems identified by DHS members were referred to the relevant departments for follow-up actions. The DOs reported the number of referrals made by DHS members on a monthly basis.*

- (d) **encourage the DOs to organise more community hygiene activities and invite more DHS members to participate in these activities with a view to maintaining the momentum of the community involvement initiatives; and**
- (e) **review regularly the DHS activities to evaluate the extent of community involvement and identify further improvement measures.**

Response from the Administration

2.10 The **Director of Home Affairs** has said that she agrees generally with the audit recommendations. She has also said that:

- (a) the HAD will encourage the DOs to continue recruiting more members for DHS;
- (b) the HAD will standardise the basis of counting the number of DHS inspections;
- (c) the HAD will develop meaningful performance indicators for DHS activities;
- (d) the HAD will encourage the DOs, where appropriate, to organise more community hygiene activities and involve more DHS members in these activities; and
- (e) the DOs will assess the effectiveness of DHS activities and identify areas for improvement from time to time, having regard to the circumstances of individual districts.

Blackspot monitoring scheme: closed-circuit televisions

2.11 Team Clean in its final report stated that notwithstanding the government departments' intensive clean-up operation on hygiene blackspots, some had remained in horrendous conditions because of the irresponsible acts of recalcitrant offenders. To eradicate these blackspots, Team Clean proposed to install closed-circuit televisions (CCTVs) at these sites for monitoring and deterrent purposes. To facilitate enforcement actions, the CCTV system would help collect information on how the hygiene problems happened (such as when, how and by whom litter and waste were illegally deposited). The presence of surveillance cameras should deter irresponsible behaviours. Team Clean emphasised that this would be a community project to be operated by community groups. The DCs and relevant district committees would select the sites and the DOs would provide the necessary support.

2.12 According to the HAD Operation Manual for the installation of the CCTV system, every effort should be made to identify a suitable taker among local community organisations to operate the CCTV system. Where a suitable community organisation cannot be readily found, the system should initially be run by the DOs with the full involvement of members of DCs/ACs/DCHKCs/DHS in operating the CCTV system, including the viewing of tapes. In line with the Government's overall objective of promoting community involvement and participation in its clean-up efforts, the Government aims to hand over the operation of the whole scheme to the community eventually.

2.13 The DOs should select suitable locations for installing CCTV systems based on the following criteria:

- (a) there exist persistent and recurrent environmental problems that cannot be resolved despite regular intensive clean-up efforts by the Government; and
- (b) there should be community support after full consultation with the DCs and other relevant district committees.

In addition to the technical and logistical viability of installing the CCTV system, it is necessary to ensure that reliable local community organisations are willing to operate the CCTV system after providing suitable sites for its installation. With the assistance of staff of the DOs, the authorised persons of the local community organisations are responsible for viewing the recorded tapes. Hygiene-related offences found on the tapes are referred to the FEHD for investigation and follow-up actions.

2.14 To consider the feasibility of introducing the CCTV scheme on a territory-wide scale, in November 2003, the HAD launched a pilot project in five districts (Note 4) for testing the cost-effectiveness of the scheme. Details are shown in Table 3.

Note 4: *The capital cost for the installation of the CCTV systems under the pilot project was \$650,000 and the associated annual recurrent cost was about \$60,000.*

Table 3

CCTV pilot project

District (Implementation date)	Location	Nature of major offences
Yuen Long (18 November 2003)	Rear lane at 47-59 On Ning Road	Pouring of waste water and washing activities by restaurants in the vicinity
Yau Tsim Mong (18 December 2003)	Rear lane at 61-91 Sai Yee Street	People obeying the call of nature
Sham Shui Po (22 December 2003)	Side lane at 201-203 Pei Ho Street	Pouring of waste water and obstruction by restaurants in the vicinity
Kowloon City (5 January 2004)	Junction of Hung Fook Street and Yuk Shing Street	Dumping of domestic waste
Eastern (21 January 2004)	Rear lane between Power Street and Fuk Yuen Street	Food preparation and washing activities by restaurants in the vicinity

Source: HAD records

Remarks: The CCTV systems in Sham Shui Po and Eastern were dismantled in August 2004 and March 2005 respectively because of improved hygiene conditions at the pilot locations. The CCTV system in Sham Shui Po was relocated to Shun Ning Road Recreation Ground in May 2005.

The HAD, with the agreement of the Steering Committee in September 2004, planned to extend the CCTV scheme to cover five other districts in August and September 2005, subject to the results of the consultation with the DCs.

Audit observations

HAD review of the CCTV scheme

- 2.15 The HAD review of the CCTV scheme in June 2004 concluded that:
- (a) the CCTV scheme had achieved some degree of deterrent effect. Although the CCTV footage could not be used as evidence for prosecution because of privacy concern (Note 5), improved hygiene conditions were observed in all of the five pilot locations as a result of the combined effect of the CCTV scheme and the stepped-up enforcement actions by the FEHD; and
 - (b) the FEHD considered that the intelligence gathered was useful for identifying the time patterns of offences and the planning of blitz operations in order to catch the offenders red-handed.

Photographs 1 and 2 show the hygiene condition of a pilot location before and after installing the CCTV system.

Note 5: *Owing to privacy concern, the main purpose of operating the CCTV system was to gather information concerning the time and behaviour patterns of depositing litter and waste at the hygiene blackspots, but not to identify offenders causing public nuisance for prosecution.*

Photograph 1

Hygiene condition of a pilot location before installing the CCTV system



Source: Photograph provided by the HAD

Photograph 2

Hygiene condition of a pilot location after installing the CCTV system



Source: Photograph provided by the HAD

Difficulties in getting the community involved

2.16 Full community involvement is crucial to the success of the CCTV scheme. Audit noted that:

- (a) of the five pilot districts, three DOs (i.e. Yau Tsim Mong, Kowloon City and Eastern) were able to secure varying degrees of community participation. The CCTV systems of the Kowloon City District and the Eastern District were operated by volunteers. The Kowloon City DO was able to recruit new volunteers in March 2005 and secure increasing community participation. However, the Yau Tsim Mong DO had to deploy its staff to view the CCTV tapes as the volunteers had declined to offer assistance since March 2004 (i.e. three months after the installation of the CCTV system); and
- (b) the CCTV systems of the other two districts (i.e. Yuen Long and Sham Shui Po) were operated by the DOs without any community participation.

Appendix B shows the degree of community participation in the CCTV pilot project during the period from November 2003 to March 2005.

2.17 **Audit found that the sustainability of community participation was doubtful because the DOs experienced difficulties in recruiting suitable volunteers to view the CCTV tapes.** The reasons were that:

- (a) the pool of viewers was small due to privacy consideration (e.g. the need to comply with the provisions of the Personal Data (Privacy) Ordinance, Cap. 486); and
- (b) local people were reluctant to serve as viewers for fear of possible revenge and legal liability.

Some members of the DCs also expressed concerns over the lack of community participation in the CCTV scheme.

Need to strengthen enforcement actions after gathering information

2.18 Audit reviewed the enforcement actions taken by the FEHD after gathering the information from the CCTV systems. Table 4 shows the number of referrals by the DOs to the FEHD, the number of blitz operations conducted by the FEHD and the number of prosecutions, including the number of fixed penalty notices (FPNs) issued, in the five pilot districts for the period from November 2003 to March 2005. Audit noted that the number of prosecutions varied from 40 in Kowloon City to 3 in Yuen Long.

Table 4
Number of referrals, blitz operations and prosecutions/FPNs
in the pilot districts for the period from November 2003 to March 2005

District	Number of referrals	Number of blitz operations	Number of prosecutions/FPNs
Kowloon City	150	60	40
Yau Tsim Mong	855	26	20
Sham Shui Po (Note)	1,073	18	9
Eastern	1,014	119	8
Yuen Long	176	75	3
Total	<u>3,268</u>	<u>298</u>	<u>80</u>

Source: HAD records

Note: The statistics for Sham Shui Po were compiled until the CCTV system was dismantled in August 2004.

2.19 Audit noted that the blitz operations conducted by the FEHD in Kowloon City, Yau Tsim Mong and Sham Shui Po matched with the time patterns identified by the CCTV systems. **However, a large proportion of operations conducted in the other two pilot districts (i.e. Eastern and Yuen Long) did not correspond with the identified time patterns.** In particular, 16 (64%) of the 25 blitz operations conducted in Yuen Long for the period from November 2003 to May 2004 did not match with the identified time pattern. Audit found that, although the hygiene-related offences (e.g. pouring of waste water) mainly occurred during 7:00 a.m. to 8:00 a.m. at the pilot location in Yuen Long, the ten FEHD blitz operations (four in December 2004 and six in January 2005) were not conducted between 7:00 a.m. and 8:00 a.m. as identified by the CCTV system.

2.20 Audit noted that since June 2004 (i.e. about six months after the installation of the CCTV systems), upon identification of the time patterns of offences at the five pilot locations, the recording and operating time of the CCTV systems had been reduced. The Sham Shui Po DO has relocated its CCTV system and the Eastern DO has planned to relocate its CCTV system. **Audit considers that the other three DOs need to relocate their CCTV systems to other hygiene blackspots with persistent and recurrent environmental problems once the time patterns of offences at the pilot locations have been identified.**

Audit recommendations

2.21 **Audit has recommended that:**

- (a) **the Director of Home Affairs should, in the light of the difficulties in getting the community involved in the CCTV scheme, critically evaluate the extent of achievements and cost-effectiveness of the scheme;**
- (b) **the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene should consider arranging more blitz operations which correspond with the time patterns of offences identified by the CCTV systems so as to enhance the effectiveness of the enforcement actions;**
- (c) **the Director of Home Affairs should, in collaboration with the Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene, closely monitor the deterrent effect of the CCTV scheme in a district on a regular basis;**
- (d) **the Director of Home Affairs should consider relocating the CCTV systems to other hygiene blackspots with persistent and recurrent environmental problems once the time patterns of offences at the pilot locations have been identified and the hygiene conditions have improved; and**
- (e) **the Director of Home Affairs should continue to monitor regularly the cleanliness at the hygiene blackspots to ensure that hygiene problems do not recur after the CCTV systems have been relocated.**

Response from the Administration

2.22 The **Director of Home Affairs** has said that:

- (a) the installation of CCTVs, coupled with enhanced enforcement, has successfully improved the hygiene conditions of the locations concerned. The scheme has proved to be a useful tool for intelligence gathering, and has helped the FEHD in the planning of blitz operations, which resulted in a considerable number of successful prosecutions. The HAD has also received positive feedback from members of the public, including the DCs. For some districts, the DOs have successfully involved local organisations in operating the CCTV systems. The HAD recognises that it is not possible to engage members of the public in some cases in running and monitoring the systems because of, for example, the amount of work involved. For those cases, the HAD staff would assist and operate the systems;

- (b) the HAD would carry out extensive community consultation before the installation of CCTV at a particular location. The consultation process could help arouse community awareness and is also an effective way of engaging the community in keeping Hong Kong clean;
- (c) the HAD considers that the CCTV pilot project is successful in general and will extend it to another five districts, subject to public consultation at the district level. Whenever possible, the HAD would try to engage the local community to operate the CCTV systems;
- (d) she agrees generally with the audit recommendation of closely monitoring the extent of deterrent effect of the CCTV scheme in a district on a regular basis. For the first pilot project, the HAD has completed the review after about a year of implementation. In the light of experience gained, the HAD considers that a review after a full-year operation will be appropriate to allow time for the scheme to take effect at a particular location;
- (e) she agrees generally with the audit recommendation of relocating the CCTV systems to other hygiene blackspots with persistent and recurrent environmental problems once the time patterns of offences committed at the pilot locations have been identified and the hygiene conditions have improved. Among the five locations in which the scheme has been implemented over a year, one CCTV system in Sham Shui Po District has already been relocated and another system in Eastern District is in the process of relocation. The Kowloon City, Yuen Long and Yau Tsim Mong DOs will consider, in consultation with the community and the relevant departments, whether relocation of the CCTV systems is necessary in their districts; and
- (f) she generally agrees with the audit recommendation of continuing to monitor regularly the cleanliness at the hygiene blackspots. Under the current arrangement, District Officers will continue to monitor hygiene conditions of all eradicated hygiene blackspots to prevent relapse. District Officers will treat blackspots which are previously monitored by CCTVs in a similar manner after the dismantling of the system.

2.23 The **Director of Food and Environmental Hygiene** has said that:

- (a) the FEHD agrees that the CCTV review could be conducted after a full-year operation; and
- (b) the FEHD agrees that it could arrange more blitz operations to correspond with the time patterns identified by the CCTV systems as far as practicable.

Coordinating role of the Home Affairs Department

2.24 Since August 2003, the following institutional arrangements have been made to facilitate effective implementation of Team Clean's measures, monitor interdepartmental coordination, and keep up the momentum both in the community and within the Government:

- (a) the HAD plays the central coordinating role in spearheading interdepartmental efforts in district hygiene improvement as well as in community involvement, and civic and health education;
- (b) relevant bureaux and departments take charge of the implementation of Team Clean's measures under their purview; and
- (c) the HAB presents to the Policy Committee led by the Chief Secretary for Administration quarterly progress reports on Team Clean's measures.

Audit observations

Inconsistent management information

2.25 Audit notes that the HAD lacks consistent management information for monitoring and evaluating the extent of success in district hygiene improvement, community involvement (see paras. 2.4 to 2.8), and civic and health education outside schools (see paras. 4.41 to 4.44) because the 18 DOs compile management information on different bases. **Audit considers that the HAD needs to conduct a comprehensive review of the various types of management information for measuring the performance of the relevant parties in keeping Hong Kong clean, and ensure that the management information provided by the 18 DOs is compiled on a standardised and consistent basis. The HAD also needs to develop meaningful performance indicators and set performance targets to evaluate the extent of success in district hygiene improvement, community involvement, and civic and health education.** The management information provided by the HAD is essential for the HAB to present the extent of success of Team Clean's measures to the Policy Committee.

Audit recommendations

2.26 **Audit has recommended that the Director of Home Affairs should:**

- (a) **conduct a comprehensive review of the various types of management information for measuring the performance of the relevant parties in keeping Hong Kong clean, and establish proper procedures to ensure that the management information provided by the 18 DOs is compiled on a standardised and consistent basis; and**

- (b) **develop meaningful performance indicators to monitor the work of the relevant parties and set performance targets to evaluate the extent of success in district hygiene improvement, community involvement, and civic and health education.**

Response from the Administration

2.27 The **Director of Home Affairs** has said that she agrees generally with the audit recommendations and will conduct a review of the various types of management information as proposed. Among other things, meaningful performance indicators/targets will be set.

PART 3: COMMUNITY INVOLVEMENT IN PUBLIC HOUSING ESTATES

3.1 This PART examines the various community involvement initiatives taken by the HD in PHEs, reports the achievements and suggests measures for further improvement.

Estate Drainage Ambassadors Scheme

3.2 The outbreak of the SARS epidemic has forged the community's consensus over the importance of good public hygiene. The investigation report on the outbreak of SARS at Amoy Gardens (Note 6) has highlighted environmental factors in the spread of the disease. This has aroused much public concern about the conditions and maintenance of drains and pipes in private buildings as well as those in PHEs.

3.3 In 2003, the HD launched the Estate Drainage Ambassadors Scheme (EDAS). The objective of the scheme was to prevent the spread of SARS in PHEs through defective internal drainage installations by performing door-to-door inspections of each individual unit in 152 PHEs (Note 7), and arranging urgent repairs where necessary. Under the scheme, the HD technical staff, contractor staff and 100 temporary Drainage Inspectors (Note 8) recruited by the HD as Drainage Ambassadors were deployed to carry out inspections and arrange repair works. When defective internal drainage installations were found, the Drainage Ambassadors would arrange repair free of charge for the tenants. The scheme was carried out in two phases during the period from May 2003 to July 2004. Details are shown in Table 5.

Note 6: *During the outbreak of SARS at Amoy Gardens towards the end of March 2003, 324 residents were infected.*

Note 7: *The EDAS covered 152 out of 183 PHEs. Inspection of the internal drainage pipes of the remaining PHEs was carried out by the contractors employed by the OCs.*

Note 8: *A temporary Drainage Inspector must possess a certificate in Construction or Building Studies from the Hong Kong Polytechnic University or a technical institute or equivalent. The main duties of a temporary Drainage Inspector were to assist in the inspection of drainage system in PHEs and supervise contractors employed in building construction and maintenance works.*

Table 5
Number of defective internal drainage installations
reported under the EDAS

Phase (Period)	Number of estates covered	Number of units inspected	Number of units with defective drainage installations	Defect rate
		(a)	(b)	$(c) = \frac{(b)}{(a)} \times 100\%$
Phase I (May to August 2003)	35 (Note 1)	109,096	45,031	41%
Phase II (September 2003 to July 2004)	117 (Note 2)	322,364	88,954	28%
Total	152	431,460	133,985	31%

Source: HD records

Note 1: Phase I covered 309 blocks in 35 older estates with a high concentration of elderly tenants.

Note 2: Phase II covered 745 blocks in 117 estates.

Audit observations

Replacement programme and inspection plan

3.4 The EDAS revealed that the problem of defective internal drainage installations in PHEs, if not resolved, might adversely affect the hygiene conditions of PHEs. The older estates in Phase I, in particular, had a high defect rate of 41% as shown in Table 5. This was partly due to the use of cast iron drainage pipes in these older estates. Audit noted that the HD had drawn up a replacement programme for cast iron drainage pipes covering 6,105 flats in 18 estates. The replacement works were scheduled for completion by 2006.

3.5 The HD has planned to conduct regular inspection of the drainage installations inside older flats so that existing or potential problems could be identified promptly. The HD has formulated the following inspection plan to be carried out by its technical staff:

- (a) once every two years for rental flats in blocks aged 25 years and above, as well as those flats that are still using cast iron drainage pipes (Note 9);
- (b) once every four years for rental flats in blocks aged between 10 years and 25 years (Note 9); and
- (c) on a need basis for those blocks that are less than 10 years old.

Audit noted that, as at 30 June 2005, the first round of inspection had not commenced as additional staff resources had yet to be deployed from other HD divisions.

Recruitment of voluntary Drainage Ambassadors

3.6 Audit appreciates the HD initiative in launching the EDAS. The HD inspection plan for the older PHEs is a positive one. **However, Audit considers that the HD measures lack community involvement.**

3.7 In Audit's view, given the success of the EDAS and the experiences gained from the scheme, future inspection programme can be carried out more effectively by involving the local public housing community. Through cooperation with local organisations (such as the Estate Management Advisory Committee (EMAC – Note 10) of each PHE) and NGOs, volunteers could be recruited to provide minor home repair and maintenance services in some estates.

Note 9: *The additional technical staff required for the proposed inspections of once every two years and once every four years were 36 and 26 respectively. The inspections would also cover water seepage and external window installations.*

Note 10: *EMAC is an estate-based committee formed to improve housing management. The role and functions of EMAC include: (a) advising the estate manager on proposals relating to security, orderliness and cleanliness; (b) reflecting tenants' views on estate management matters; and (c) participating in estate community activities (e.g. cleansing campaigns). An EMAC comprises the chairman or elected representatives from MACs and the Commercial Tenants Association, elected and appointed DC members, and the responsible estate manager as the chairman of the committee. All EMAC members are appointed by the Permanent Secretary for Housing, Planning and Lands (Housing).*

Home repair and maintenance services provided by NGOs

3.8 **Audit research revealed that some organisations are providing home repair and maintenance services to those in need** (Note 11). Services provided by these organisations include home repairs, safety inspections and rewiring services for the households of the elderly. Audit notes that one NGO, the St. James' Settlement, has provided, since 1990-91, home maintenance services to the elderly. Such services include installation and repairs of internal drainage pipes. As at 30 April 2005, the St. James' Settlement had about 300 volunteers providing home maintenance services to elderly people living in different districts in Hong Kong.

Audit recommendations

3.9 **Audit has recommended that the Director of Housing should:**

- (a) **expedite the deployment of staff resources from other HD divisions to carry out the inspection programme for defective internal drainage installations in PHEs; and**
- (b) **consider involving NGOs to provide minor home repair and maintenance services in PHEs.**

Response from the Administration

3.10 The **Director of Housing** has said that the HD generally agrees with the audit observations and recommendations. He has also said that:

- (a) the customer satisfaction level on the cleanliness of PHEs has improved since the implementation of various Team Clean's measures; and
- (b) to sustain efforts, the HD commenced the first round of regular inspections of internal drainage installations with available staff deployed from other HD divisions in September 2005. The HD has worked with NGOs in the provision of volunteers for minor home repair services in some estates. The HD will continue to expand the services to widen community involvement in this aspect.

Note 11: *These organisations include the Caritas-Hong Kong, the Hong Kong Council of Social Service, the St. James' Settlement and the CLP Power.*

3.11 The **Secretary for Financial Services and the Treasury** has said that he agrees with the audit recommendation that the Director of Housing should expedite the deployment of staff resources from other HD divisions to carry out the inspection programme for defective internal drainage installations in PHEs.

Public Housing Estate Cleanliness Incentive Scheme

3.12 The Public Housing Estate Cleanliness Incentive Scheme (PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme) was launched in June 2003 to encourage the PHE residents to maintain a high level of cleanliness not only in their own units but also in their surroundings. The objective of the incentive scheme was to establish a new cleansing culture by mobilising residents to do cleansing of their own accord on a long-term and sustainable basis.

3.13 Under the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme, estate managers of PHEs organise cleansing exercises to mobilise members of EMACs and residents' associations, and volunteers of NGOs to clean the common areas of PHEs, and organise various activities to promote estate cleanliness. These activities include cleansing slogan contest, photographic/poster design competition, the cleanest PHE competition, cleansing/environmental protection carnival and the distribution of bleaching agents to the tenants. During the period from January 2004 to March 2005, the HD organised 247 cleansing activities (including 100 cleansing exercises) under the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme, involving 77,499 local residents and 2,292 volunteers. Details are shown in Table 6.

Table 6
Cleansing activities during the period
from January 2004 to March 2005

Quarter ended	Region					Total
	Kowloon East	Kowloon West and Hong Kong	Kwai Tsing, Tsuen Wan and Islands	Tai Po, North, Sha Tin and Sai Kung	Tuen Mun and Yuen Long	
(Number of cleansing activities)						
2004						
March	4	20	12	5	15	56
June	7	10	10	15	11	53
September	1	6	11	7	6	31
December	5	5	9	13	5	37
2005						
March	6	16	14	17	17	70
Total	<u>23</u>	<u>57</u>	<u>56</u>	<u>57</u>	<u>54</u>	<u>247</u>

Source: HD records

Remarks: The cleansing activities during the period from June 2003 to December 2003 were not included because the composition of estates in each region was different.

3.14 In collaboration with the launching of the scheme, since September 2003, the comprehensive cleansing exercise "Operation Tai Ping Tei" (Note 12), traditionally held in all PHEs near the Chinese New Year, has increased to four times a year. Besides, Team Clean

Note 12: The "Operation Tai Ping Tei" is a cleansing campaign organised to boost the awareness of cleanliness amongst PHE residents through the participation of the whole community (including HD staff, cleansing contractors' staff, local residents and volunteers) in a series of comprehensive cleansing activities in PHEs.

Corners are set up in PHEs where photographs of estate hygiene blackspots showing marked improvements after the implementation of Team Clean's measures are posted to keep residents abreast of those activities and results, and reinforce the message that it is important for all concerned to sustain the cleansing measures to create a pleasant and hygienic living environment.

Audit observations

Improved perception of cleanliness and hygiene conditions

3.15 Audit notes that the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme and the other initiatives (Note 13) have brought about a general improvement in the perception of the PHE residents towards the cleanliness and hygiene conditions of PHEs. This is substantiated by the findings of the HD Public Housing Recurrent Annual Survey. Table 7 shows the residents' satisfaction level of the cleanliness and hygiene conditions of common areas in their estates from 2002 to 2004. The residents' satisfaction level increased from 46% in 2002 to 62% in 2004. Their dissatisfaction level reduced from 23% in 2002 to 16% in 2004.

Table 7

Level of satisfaction with the cleanliness and hygiene conditions of common areas in the public rental housing estates

Satisfaction level	2002	2003	2004
Very satisfied/satisfied	46%	52%	62%
Moderate	31%	29%	22%
Dissatisfied/very dissatisfied	23%	19%	16%
Total	100%	100%	100%

Source: HD records

Note 13: Other initiatives included the Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme (see para. 3.22).

**Community participation in the
PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme**

3.16 One of the critical success factors of the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme is community involvement. The participation of EMACs and NGOs in the 247 cleansing activities conducted in PHEs under the HD's five regions (i.e. the Kowloon East Region, the Kowloon West and Hong Kong Region, the Kwai Tsing, Tsuen Wan and Islands Region, the Tai Po, North, Sha Tin and Sai Kung Region, and the Tuen Mun and Yuen Long Region) during the period from January 2004 to March 2005 is shown in Table 8.

Table 8

**Participation of EMACs and NGOs in the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme
during the period from January 2004 to March 2005**

Quarter ended	Region												Total
	Kowloon East		Kowloon West and Hong Kong		Kwai Tsing, Tsuen Wan and Islands		Tai Po, North, Sha Tin and Sai Kung		Tuen Mun and Yuen Long				
(Number of EMACs and NGOs)													
	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO	
2004													
March	4	1	12	2	12	2	5	6	12	16	45	27	
June	7	2	10	8	8	3	13	75	9	10	47	98	
September	1	1	6	5	8	4	7	55	5	5	27	70	
December	3	1	5	13	7	2	10	30	4	8	29	54	
2005													
March	6	3	16	71	11	2	16	—	15	7	64	83	
Total	21	8	49	99	46	13	51	166	45	46	212	332	

Source: HD records

Remarks: The cleansing activities during the period from June 2003 to December 2003 were not included because the composition of estates in each region was different.

3.17 According to the records of the HD, 77,499 local residents and 2,292 volunteers participated in cleansing activities during the period from January 2004 to March 2005. Details are shown in Table 9.

Table 9
Participation of local residents and volunteers
in the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme
during the period from January 2004 to March 2005

Quarter ended	Region												Total
	Kowloon East		Kowloon West and Hong Kong		Kwai Tsing, Tsuen Wan and Islands		Tai Po, North, Sha Tin and Sai Kung		Tuen Mun and Yuen Long				
(Number of local residents and volunteers)													
	R	V	R	V	R	V	R	V	R	V	R	V	
2004													
March	1,820	195	4,231	100	1,467	39	820	25	3,307	25	11,645	384	
June	1,718	67	1,496	210	1,435	150	6,936	160	270	–	11,855	587	
September	1,892	15	1,765	10	1,711	22	774	92	1,450	15	7,592	154	
December	1,170	100	2,250	–	1,195	28	17,223	45	990	358	22,828	531	
2005													
March	1,192	176	3,146	78	689	36	12,848	95	5,704	251	23,579	636	
Total	7,792	553	12,888	398	6,497	275	38,601	417	11,721	649	77,499	2,292	

Legend: R denotes local residents
V denotes volunteers

Source: HD records

Remarks: The cleansing activities during the period from June 2003 to December 2003 were not included because the composition of estates in each region was different.

***Inadequate local community participation
in cleansing exercises in PHEs***

3.18 Audit assessed the extent of local community involvement in the 100 cleansing exercises conducted in PHEs under the HD's five regions during the period from January 2004 to March 2005. Audit noted that:

- (a) in the Tai Po, North, Sha Tin and Sai Kung Region, no cleansing exercise had been conducted since the third quarter of 2004 (see Appendix C); and
- (b) in the Kwai Tsing, Tsuen Wan and Islands Region:
 - (i) no EMAC had participated in the cleansing exercises during the period from April to December 2004 (see Appendix D);
 - (ii) no NGO had participated in the cleansing exercises since the third quarter of 2004 (see Appendix D); and
 - (iii) only 496 local residents and 22 volunteers had participated in the cleansing exercises during the period from January 2004 to March 2005 (see Appendix E).

3.19 In view of the inadequate local community participation in cleansing exercises during the period from January 2004 to March 2005 in some regions, the HD needs to review the adequacy of the incentives provided under the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme to give recognition to the efforts and contributions of the local community. **To increase the level of local community involvement, Audit considers that the HD needs to analyse the experience of those regions which have been successful in organising activities under the incentive scheme and disseminate the good practices to all regions for further improvement. In the longer term, the HD needs to consider benchmarking the good performance of individual regions for continuous improvement of the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme.**

Audit recommendations

3.20 **Audit has recommended that the Director of Housing should:**

- (a) **review the adequacy of the incentives provided under the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme to give recognition to the efforts and contributions of EMACs and NGOs;**

- (b) **encourage all EMACs and more NGOs to participate in the cleansing exercises;**
- (c) **analyse the experience of those regions which have been successful in organising activities under the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme and disseminate the good practices to all regions with a view to increasing the level of local community involvement; and**
- (d) **consider, in the longer term, benchmarking the good performance of individual regions for continuous improvement of the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme.**

Response from the Administration

3.21 The **Director of Housing** has said that the HD generally agrees with the audit observations and recommendations. He has also said that:

- (a) in order to establish a new cleansing culture in PHEs, participation of tenants in cleansing operations, as well as other promotional and educational activities should be encouraged. The HD has therefore arranged a wide range of cleansing activities under the PHE Cleanliness Incentive Scheme (such as cleansing slogan competition, cleansing/environmental protection carnivals and cleanest PHE/block competition);
- (b) to increase the level of local community involvement, the HD will explore the options of providing more incentives under the scheme; and
- (c) the HD will encourage regions to share their experience in organising various activities, particularly for those regions where the rate of community participation is lower than that of other regions.

Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme

3.22 The HD obtained government funding of \$3 million to launch an Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme in June 2003. The objective of the scheme was to encourage cleansing workers to maintain high sanitary standard and boost the hygiene conditions of food premises located in HD shopping centres.

3.23 The scheme provided the Best Hygiene Award for Food Premises and the Excellence Award for Toilet Cleaners. During the six-month period from June to November 2003, monthly competitions were organised in the 131 HD shopping centres to select the cleanest food premises and the most outstanding toilet attendants. Patrons of HD shopping centres were invited to vote for the most hygienic food premises and the best toilet attendants. The top five ranking food premises and toilets were short-listed and then assessed by an adjudicating panel (Note 14). Members of the adjudicating panel visited the premises before delivering their judgement. In addition to the presentation of awards, prizes including supermarket cash coupons for toilet attendants, certificates for food premises, trophies for the award-winning food premises, cash coupons and hand sanitizers were distributed to the winners.

3.24 The Best Hygiene Award for Food Premises was given to 132 commercial tenants and 42 of them remained in the first place for six consecutive months. The Excellence Award for Toilet Cleaners was given to 359 cleansing workers. About two million votes were returned by patrons of the 131 HD shopping centres. The Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme ended in December 2003.

Audit observations

Improved customer satisfaction level

3.25 Audit noted that the activities of the Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme involved estate managers, shop owners and employees. More importantly, the public housing community was mobilised to participate in the activities through voting. According to the results of the HD Public Housing Recurrent Annual Survey, there were some improvements in customer satisfaction level on the cleanliness of HD shopping centres in 2004 as compared with 2003. Details are shown in Table 10. Apparently, the incentive scheme was well received by the public and the commercial tenants.

Note 14: *An adjudicating panel comprised school principals and members/representatives of merchant associations, the DO, the DC, the Legislative Council, the FEHD and the relevant EMAC. The Housing Manager monitored the entire selection process.*

Table 10

**Customer satisfaction level on cleanliness
of HD shopping centres**

Customer satisfaction level	Public Rental Housing residents		Tenants Purchase Scheme residents		Home Ownership Scheme residents	
	2003	2004	2003	2004	2003	2004
Very satisfied/satisfied	67%	72%	51%	58%	48%	53%
Fair	27%	22%	43%	35%	41%	36%
Dissatisfied/ very dissatisfied	6%	6%	6%	7%	11%	11%
Total	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%	100%

Source: HD records

Remarks: Prior to 2003, the level of customer satisfaction on HD shopping centres was reported in the annual Tracking Survey. Satisfaction indices, with a maximum of five points, were computed to reflect the number of respondents who graded cleanliness of toilets and public areas in different types of shopping centres as average or satisfactory. The customer satisfaction levels on the cleanliness of toilets and public areas in HD shopping centres in 2001-02 and 2002-03 were 3.33 and 3.36 respectively.

Need to introduce incentive schemes on an ongoing basis

3.26 To sustain and monitor the impact of the Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme, Audit considers that the scheme needs to continue. As the owner of the shopping centres, the HD should take the lead to introduce incentive award schemes, similar to the Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme, and invite the commercial tenants to sponsor the prizes and awards. In the longer term, the role of the HD may be changed to that of a facilitator (i.e. the commercial tenants would organise the scheme themselves).

Audit recommendations

3.27 **Audit has recommended that the Director of Housing should:**

- (a) **take the lead to introduce incentive award schemes, similar to the Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme, on an ongoing basis to further improve the cleanliness of HD shopping centres;**
- (b) **continue to monitor the impact of the Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme by tracking the level of customer satisfaction on the cleanliness of HD shopping centres;**
- (c) **consider inviting the commercial tenants to sponsor prizes and awards for incentive award schemes; and**
- (d) **in the longer term, introduce measures to facilitate the commercial tenants to organise similar incentive award schemes.**

Response from the Administration

3.28 The **Director of Housing** has said that the HD generally agrees with the audit observations and recommendations. He has also said that the Estate Commercial Cleanliness Incentive Scheme was well received by the commercial tenants and customers. The HD will explore the option of continuing the scheme on an ongoing basis with the provision of incentive awards and sponsorship from commercial tenants.

PART 4: CIVIC AND HEALTH EDUCATION

4.1 This PART examines the promotion of life-long civic responsibility and healthy lifestyle through civic and health education in schools (see paras. 4.2 to 4.33) and outside schools (see paras. 4.34 to 4.47), reports the achievements, and suggests measures for further improvement.

Civic and health education in schools

4.2 Civic and health education starts at home, is reinforced in schools, and takes hold in the community. It is the cornerstone of building community ownership and the key to sustainable hygiene improvement. Many hygiene problems are often the results of irresponsible and reckless behaviour of people who lack civic awareness and responsibility.

4.3 High priority is accorded to promoting civic responsibility and good hygiene practices among students so that they will grow up to be law-abiding and healthy citizens. Students often serve as agents of change in their families and help build a caring, civilised and healthy community in the future.

4.4 After the outbreak of SARS, the EMB reviewed the school curriculum and teaching mode with regard to civic and health education. The EMB subsequently adopted a new approach to promote life-long civic responsibility and healthy lifestyle among students. The key measures under this new approach are:

- (a) strengthening civic and health education in school curriculum;
- (b) enhancing school development plans and quality assurance system;
- (c) enhancing the capability of schools in the instruction of civic and hygiene education;
- (d) providing students with “learning-by-doing” opportunities to lead and sustain a healthy lifestyle;
- (e) conducting regular surveys on student awareness and habits of personal, home and community hygiene; and
- (f) strengthening communication between schools, families and government departments.

Strengthening civic and health education in school curriculum

4.5 In 2001, the Curriculum Development Council stated in the report “Learning to Learn: The Way Forward in Curriculum Development” that civic responsibility and healthy lifestyle would be included in the seven learning goals that students should achieve in the curriculum reform. Since then, civic and health education has been conducted through the formal curriculum (e.g. General Studies, Biology, and Science and Technology), moral and civic education (e.g. school assembly and counselling activities), and life events and life-wide learning experiences (e.g. voluntary community service).

4.6 As one of the initiatives of Team Clean, the Curriculum Development Institute of the EMB was tasked to strengthen the civic and health education in the curriculum of primary and secondary schools. Through Health Promoting School (HPS – Note 15) seminars in 2003 and 2004, advice was provided to teachers on how to incorporate civic and health issues into themes for project learning and formal curricula, and identify and bridge gaps in their existing curriculum regarding civic and health education.

4.7 Since 2003, the EMB has commissioned the City University of Hong Kong to conduct an annual survey on various issues including the school curriculum reform. The 2003 survey showed that over 90% of the surveyed schools had implemented moral and civic education in schools through various modes (such as morning assembly, theme-based talks and extra-curricular activities). The schools also provided life-wide learning experiences for all students to achieve whole person development. Up to 30 June 2005, the EMB was in the process of compiling the report of the 2004 survey. The EMB has planned to incorporate new elements on civic and health education (such as Liberal Studies, other new elective subjects and through “Other Learning Experiences”) in the new senior secondary curriculum.

Enhancing school development plans and quality assurance system

4.8 School planning and self-evaluation form part of school-based management and the school management is held accountable for the provision of quality education. While schools are required to conduct self-evaluation as an internal quality assurance process, the

Note 15: *The concept of HPS was first introduced by the World Health Organisation in the 1980s. It has been widely accepted by school health professionals as an effective and important method of implementing school health education.*

EMB conducts External School Reviews (ESRs)/inspections (Note 16) as an external quality assurance mechanism.

4.9 When conducting ESRs/inspections, the EMB's review/inspection teams included school development plans and the promotion of healthy lifestyle by schools as part of the focuses. They also offered advice and support for the schools to draw up development plans for further improvement. In the 2003-04 school year, 54 focus inspections were conducted. According to the findings of the inspections, most of the inspected schools, including primary schools, accorded priority to fostering students' concepts of health. In addition, the performance in health education of about one-third of the schools was rated as excellent or good. The EMB conducted ESRs on 99 schools in the 2003-04 school year and 139 schools in the 2004-05 school year. The percentage of schools with planning on and implementation of health and hygiene education increased from 59% in the 2003-04 school year to 85% in the 2004-05 school year.

***Enhancing the capability of schools
in the instruction of civic and hygiene education***

4.10 The EMB has employed the HPS concept as one of the tools to promote life-long civic responsibility and healthy lifestyle among students. In July and October 2003, the EMB, the Department of Health and the Centre for Health Education and Health Promotion (CHEHP) of The Chinese University of Hong Kong (CUHK) jointly organised a series of three-day HPS courses for all schools. Another series of short courses were subsequently organised for schools that missed the three-day courses. The objectives of these HPS courses were to help principals and teachers of primary and secondary schools:

- (a) acquire concepts and practical knowledge about HPS;
- (b) develop in students a strong commitment to personal hygiene, healthy living styles and civic responsibilities to sustain development of a health-promoting society; and
- (c) understand the concepts and issues related to health policies and the physical environment at schools.

Note 16: *Since the 2003-04 school year, the EMB has applied ESR as a major review mode while maintaining the focus inspections and still keeping a small number of quality assurance inspections on a need basis. ESR is a broad review of school performance covering the four domains of school work (i.e. management and organisation, learning and teaching, support for students and school ethos, and student performance). Under focus inspection, a school is inspected on specific Key Learning Areas and specific aspects of the school's work. Under quality assurance inspection, a school is inspected on all Key Learning Areas (such as Chinese Language Education, English Language Education and Science Education) as well as all aspects of the school's work.*

During the period from July to October 2003, staff of 614 (or 78%) primary schools and 427 (or 85%) secondary schools attended the HPS courses.

4.11 As a longer-term measure to sustain the impact of the HPS, from July to November 2004, the EMB and the CHEHP of the CUHK jointly organised one-day extended courses. During this period, staff of 297 (or 39%) primary schools and 227 (or 44%) secondary schools participated in the one-day extended HPS courses.

Providing students with “learning-by-doing” opportunities to lead and sustain a healthy lifestyle

4.12 ***Pledge Day on “Live Hygiene Live Health”.*** The EMB encouraged all kindergartens, primary schools and secondary schools to organise an annual Pledge Day on “My Pledge to Act – Live Hygiene Live Health” in 2003. The aims of the Pledge Day are to:

- (a) encourage students to lead a healthy lifestyle through a collective commitment;
- (b) cultivate students’ social morality through participating in building a clean campus;
- (c) demonstrate the commitment of school sector to support the mission of “Live Hygiene Live Health”; and
- (d) rally concerted effort from society to establish a good international image for Hong Kong.

In the 2003-04 school year, 1,050 schools organised Pledge Day. In the 2004-05 school year, 1,068 schools organised Pledge Day. The overall participation rate was about 50% in both years.

4.13 ***“Live Hygiene Live Health” student website.*** A student website “Live Hygiene Live Health” (Note 17) was launched in mid-September 2003 to sharpen student awareness of and interest in public hygiene. There are four sections in this website (viz. forum, hygiene hot spots, personal hygiene checklist and useful links). The EMB considers that this student website should be promoted as a useful learning resource for teachers to organise projects and related activities.

Note 17: The address of the website is “<http://cd1.emb.hkedcity.net/cd/cleanHK/eng/clean0.asp>”.

4.14 **Country Parks Adoption Scheme.** The Country Parks Adoption Scheme started in 1988. It is a joint project of the EMB, the Community Youth Club (CYC – Note 18) and the Agriculture, Fisheries and Conservation Department. One of the objectives of the scheme is to offer students the opportunities to serve the community through cleaning the country parks. During the period from August 2003 to March 2005, 324 voluntary cleansing services were provided in various country parks involving about 8,600 students.

4.15 **Greening for the Chest.** Greening for the Chest is an educational fund-raising programme run by the Community Chest annually. The programme encourages individuals, schools and organisations to clean up the environment (e.g. picnic and barbecue sites) and plant at designated locations with a view to building a greener and cleaner environment. During the period from August 2003 to March 2005, 70 school-based and 28 district-based activities were organised involving about 23,000 students.

Conducting regular surveys on student awareness and habits of personal, home and community hygiene

4.16 According to Team Clean's final report, the EMB pledged to conduct regular surveys from mid-2004 to assess students' knowledge and perceptions of civic and health education, their community work experiences, skills and attitudes related to personal, home and community hygiene, and civic responsibility. In March 2005, the EMB commissioned the CHEHP of the CUHK to conduct a cross-sectional school-based survey on impact of HPS. The survey included three types of schools (i.e. schools with no training in HPS, schools with training in HPS courses in 2003 and 2004, and schools with the Hong Kong Healthy Schools Award (the Award schools – see paras. 4.25 to 4.28)). For each type of schools, six primary schools and four secondary schools were selected for obtaining students' feedback on the following areas:

- (a) hygiene practices at schools, home and public areas;
- (b) knowledge on public hygiene;
- (c) behaviour on healthy life;
- (d) perception of school hygiene environment;

Note 18: *The CYC Scheme was launched in 1978. The main objective of the scheme is to educate students on moral and social values, and how to become good citizens. The scheme draws its members from students of senior primary (i.e. Primary 4 to Primary 6) and secondary schools (i.e. Form 1 to Form 7). Its membership increased from 16,382 in 1978 to about 124,000 in 2004.*

- (e) understanding of school policy on hygiene; and
- (f) understanding of community involvement on health and hygiene.

Up to 30 June 2005, the CHEHP of the CUHK was in the process of compiling the report for the student survey and the impact analysis.

Strengthening communication between schools, families and government departments

4.17 Parental support to schools and students is crucial for extending good practices of personal hygiene learnt at school to the home and the community. The establishment of Parent-Teacher Associations (PTAs) has greatly facilitated home-school cooperation.

4.18 ***Parent-Teacher Associations.*** In 1993, the Government established the Committee on Home-School Cooperation and started to advance home-school cooperation in the late 1990s. The number of schools with PTAs rose from 223 in the 1993-94 school year to 1,432 in the 2004-05 school year. In the 2004-05 school year, there were 206 (or 28%) kindergartens, 715 (or 94%) primary schools, 449 (or 87%) secondary schools and 62 (or 94%) special education schools with PTAs.

4.19 ***Pilot HPS seminar for parents.*** In November 2003, the EMB, the CHEHP of the CUHK and the Joint Council of PTAs of Sha Tin District jointly organised a pilot HPS seminar. This pilot seminar was organised to ascertain the feasibility of delivering HPS seminars to parents. Forty parents and teachers from 27 schools attended the pilot HPS seminar. After the seminar, 30 participants returned the completed course evaluation questionnaire. About 76% of the respondents found the seminar successful in helping parents know their roles in a health-promoting school and participate more in the HPS work. Six participating parents were further interviewed. They all agreed that parents could play an important role in promoting health among students.

4.20 Liaison meetings among the EMB, the Department of Health and the CHEHP of the CUHK were held regularly to foster and sustain Team Clean's measures (such as recruitment of HPS course participants, reviewing the HPS courses and conducting survey on students' attitudes towards health and civic issues).

***Quality Education Fund projects
related to the Health Promoting School concept***

4.21 The key measures to promote life-long civic responsibility and healthy lifestyle among students were partly inspired by many good practices emanating from a number of relevant Quality Education Fund (QEF — Note 19) projects from 1998 to 2004. The Professional Diploma Programme in Health Education (the Diploma Programme) and the Hong Kong Healthy Schools Award Scheme (the Award Scheme) were initiated and conducted by the CHEHP of the CUHK, with grants from the QEF, to try out the HPS concept through training courses for teachers and granting of awards to schools.

Professional Diploma Programme in Health Education

4.22 The Diploma Programme was launched in 1998 by the CHEHP of the CUHK as a pilot programme to prepare teachers and school administrators to teach health education in schools. The mission of this Diploma Programme is to promote the concepts of positive health in both school and home environment for students, staff and parents. Its ultimate objective is that every school in Hong Kong should have at least one trained educator in health promotion and health education. The trained health educators can detect physical, psychological and social problems of students at an early stage and give appropriate advice to prevent further complications. Hence, they can work closely with parents and community leaders in promoting positive health and creating a healthy environment at schools, at home and in the community.

4.23 In 1998, the Diploma Programme aimed to train about 200 health educators by organising a Professional Diploma Course in Health Education. In 1999, to extend the impetus of this programme, the CHEHP of the CUHK sought further grants from the QEF to train 240 more health educators (Note 20). During the programme period from October 1998 to September 2004, the CHEHP of the CUHK received 1,139 applications for the Professional Diploma Course and enrolled 608 participants, mainly head teachers and teachers from primary and secondary schools. At the end of the Diploma Programme in September 2004, 513 (or 84%) of the 608 participants graduated. According to the feedback from the participants, the course improved their health knowledge and enhanced their skills in health education.

Note 19: *In October 1997, the Chief Executive announced in his Policy Address the establishment of the QEF to finance projects for the promotion of quality education in Hong Kong. The QEF, established on 2 January 1998 with an allocation of \$5 billion, provides an effective channel for worthwhile projects from the school education sector to be funded. All the projects funded by the QEF must not carry any recurrent financial implications on the QEF beyond their own project duration.*

Note 20: *The QEF provided a total grant of \$23.7 million for the Diploma Programme.*

4.24 Apart from the self-evaluation conducted by the CHEHP of the CUHK and overseas experts, an external reviewer was appointed by the QEF to conduct evaluation of the Diploma Programme. The overall assessment was excellent. The QEF Secretariat also observed that the overall goal of health promotion, including the balanced enhancement of physical, mental and social health, coupled with the factors inhibiting them, has been achieved. The Diploma Programme is in a successful self-running mode, fully taken up by the CHEHP of the CUHK after completion of the programme.

The Hong Kong Healthy Schools Award Scheme

4.25 The Award Scheme, initiated and administered by the CHEHP of the CUHK with QEF funding support, was launched in 2001 (Note 21). The Award Scheme builds on the concept of HPS to encourage educational achievement, better health and emotional well-being, and supports students in improving the quality of their lives. It provides a structured management framework for the development of HPS in schools as well as a system of monitoring progress and recognition of achievement.

4.26 The CHEHP of the CUHK and the EMB are the awarding bodies of the Award Scheme. The Award Scheme covers six key areas (i.e. school health policies, school health services, personal health skills, school social environment, community relationships and school physical environment). More information about the Award Scheme is given in Appendix F.

4.27 Up to 31 August 2004, 101 schools joined the Award Scheme. The QEF appointed an external reviewer to conduct an evaluation of the Award Scheme. The overall assessment by the external reviewer was favourable and in view of the extensive impact of the project on health promotion with a large number of direct and indirect beneficiaries, the project was considered cost-effective. The CHEHP of the CUHK continued the Award Scheme after the QEF ceased to provide funding support in June 2004.

Wider parental involvement in the Award Scheme

4.28 The Award Scheme has induced wider parental involvement. According to research results of the CHEHP of the CUHK on the role of PTAs of the Award schools in promoting better health and hygiene for school children:

Note 21: *The QEF provided a grant of \$22 million for the Award Scheme from April 2001 to June 2004.*

- (a) the percentage of PTAs taking part in the review of the health promotion annual plan increased from 16% in the 2001-02 school year to 66% in the 2003-04 school year;
- (b) the percentage of parents acting as instructors in implementing health promoting programmes increased from 21% in the 2001-02 school year to 63% in the 2003-04 school year; and
- (c) the percentage of parents acting as volunteers in the school health-promoting activities (such as cleaning the school campus and running the school medical rooms) increased from 21% in the 2001-02 school year to 57% in the 2003-04 school year after introducing the HPS concept to the participating schools.

Audit observations

4.29 Healthy lifestyle is one of the seven learning goals in the curriculum reform. Apart from encouraging schools to adopt effective approaches, through the formal curriculum, moral and civic education, and life events and life-wide learning experiences, the EMB has also highlighted the HPS concept as one of the useful tools to promote civic and health education in schools. Some basic concepts of HPS have been advocated for the promotion of health awareness among schools under the Team Clean initiative. The HPS framework is a holistic, whole school approach covering all aspects of schools (such as school curriculum, school development planning and evaluation, school health service, school environment and ethos). The progress of the various measures implemented by the EMB is mentioned in paragraphs 4.5 to 4.20. In addition, there are pilot projects (i.e. the Diploma Programme and the Award Scheme) with grants from the QEF. **In order to evaluate the extent of success of the new approach in promoting civic and health education in schools, Audit considers that the EMB needs to conduct a comprehensive assessment of the overall impact of the health promotion measures as early as possible.**

Need to assess the impact of trained health educators at schools

4.30 The student survey, mentioned in paragraph 4.16, was based on schools with no training in HPS, schools with training in HPS courses offered by the EMB/the CHEHP of the CUHK and the Award schools. Audit noted that there was no separate survey on schools with trained health educators. **Audit considers that in order to evaluate the impact of trained health educators at schools, separate samples of schools with trained health educators need to be included in the student survey.**

Need to decide on the best way forward

4.31 The EMB has highlighted the HPS concept as one of the useful tools to promote civic and health education in schools. Both the Diploma Programme and the Award Scheme, initiated by the CHEHP of the CUHK as pilot projects, relate to the HPS concept. Audit notes that the evaluation results of these projects are very positive. The overall assessment of the Diploma Programme is excellent and that of the Award Scheme is very favourable. **In view of the encouraging results, Audit considers that the EMB needs to decide on the best way forward to make full use of the benefits derived from the Diploma Programme and the Award Scheme.**

Audit recommendations

4.32 **Audit has recommended that the Secretary for Education and Manpower should:**

- (a) **conduct a comprehensive assessment of the overall impact of the health promotion measures as early as possible;**
- (b) **assess the impact of the trained health educators at schools by including schools with trained health educators, as a separate category for evaluation, in future surveys of student awareness and habits of personal, home and community hygiene;**
- (c) **make full use of the benefits derived from the Diploma Programme and the Award Scheme run by the CHEHP of the CUHK, and keep track of their subsequent development to ensure that they supplement the measures taken by the EMB on health promotion; and**
- (d) **evaluate the need for providing a trained health educator in each school, as initiated by the CHEHP of the CUHK, and the desirability of encouraging all schools to achieve the status of a health-promoting school.**

Response from the Administration

4.33 The **Secretary for Education and Manpower** has said that he welcomes the audit recommendations on the promotion of life-long civic responsibility and healthy lifestyle among students. The overall aims of the school curriculum are to provide all students with essential life-long learning experiences for whole-person development in the domains of ethics, intellect, physical development, social skill and aesthetics so that all students can become active, responsible and contributing members of society, the nation and

the world. Leading a healthy lifestyle is one of the seven learning goals that students should be able to achieve. He has also said that:

- (a) the EMB agrees to the need to conduct a comprehensive impact study on health promotion measures. As a start, the Bureau has already used the 2005 survey data (see para. 4.16) to evaluate the impact of different health promotion measures on hygiene practices, students' knowledge and behaviour on healthy life, and their perception of school hygiene environment. The EMB will follow up with a comprehensive approach in the future stages having regard to the findings of the survey in progress. It is worth pointing out that 99 and 139 schools underwent ESRs in the 2003-04 and 2004-05 school years respectively. During this period, the percentage of schools with planning on and implementation of health and hygiene education increased from 59% to 85%. General strategies adopted by the EMB were to:
 - (i) establish a group/committee to plan and coordinate the work on health and hygiene education;
 - (ii) integrate the elements of health and hygiene education into the formal and informal school curriculum; and
 - (iii) implement the curriculum through lessons and school activities (such as talks, competitions and drama);
- (b) the EMB will look into the impact of trained health educators as a separate sample in the future stages of evaluation/survey. The 2005 impact analysis has already incorporated trained health educators as one of the factors for analysis;
- (c) the EMB has already made use of the benefits derived from the Diploma Programme and the Award Scheme. For example, the HPS courses have utilised the experience and expertise from the participating schools and teachers to demonstrate the good practices in health and civic education. Through the established, regular liaison meetings among the EMB, the Department of Health and the CHEHP of the CUHK, the development of these initiatives is being kept track to ensure their supplementary role towards the EMB measures on health promotion; and
- (d) the EMB has already examined the need for providing a trained health educator in each school as initiated by the CHEHP of the CUHK and the desirability of enforcing all schools to achieve the status of a health-promoting school during the formulation of the existing health promotion measures at schools, after reviewing the curriculum and the teaching mode with regard to civic and health education. The initiatives of the CUHK are now under their self-sustained mode, complementing the effort of the EMB. The existing approach of the EMB is to disseminate the good practice derived from these initiatives widely to

all schools through a number of key measures, including the HPS courses to ensure school heads and teachers responsible for moral and civic education to acquire the basic practical knowledge of health promotion under the HPS framework. The EMB will conduct regular surveys to assess the ongoing health promotion measures at schools.

Civic and health education outside schools

4.34 Most hygiene problems result from irresponsible and reckless acts of people with little civic responsibility. Educating the adults and the wider community on their civic responsibility in maintaining public hygiene warrants effort no less than that for school children. To strengthen and intensify civic education, the Committee on the Promotion of Civic Education (CPCE – Note 22), the main advisory body for promoting civic awareness and responsibility, works jointly with the HAB. The HAB provides the necessary support services to the CPCE.

4.35 In April 2003, the CPCE set up a special working group on anti-SARS measures and adopted the slogan “Do your bit for the good of all” as the main theme of its civic and health education programmes on improving environmental hygiene. In 2003, the CPCE launched the following civic and health education programmes:

- (a) a joint publicity programme with the printed and electronic media to promote the theme “Do your bit for the good of all”;
- (b) the production of four Announcements in the Public Interest on television for promoting good personal and environmental hygiene;
- (c) the transmission of a series of short message signals through four mobile phone companies on improving environmental hygiene;
- (d) in cooperation with the EMB, the publication of a collection of articles and pictures on the deeds and efforts by medical staff and other members of the public in fighting SARS for distribution to students and the public; and

Note 22: *The terms of reference of the CPCE, established in 1986, are: (a) to study, discuss and make proposals on the objectives and scope of civic education and its ways of implementation; (b) to liaise with and assist in the efforts of various departments and community organisations in promoting civic education; and (c) to encourage all sectors of the community to actively promote civic awareness and responsibility. In 2005, the CPCE has 38 members (29 unofficial members and 9 government representatives) appointed by the Secretary for Home Affairs.*

- (e) inclusion of suitable themes on enhancing environmental hygiene in a weekly animation television programme for young children.

In parallel with these civic and health education programmes, the CPCE implemented the Community Participation Scheme (Note 23) to provide financial sponsorship to NGOs for organising civic education projects at the district level and operated the Civic Education Resource Centre (Note 24) to promote civic education in the community. To strengthen the work of civic education, Team Clean recommended the CPCE to enhance its role and programmes, and set up a mechanism to tap the views of junior citizens on the promotion of civic awareness and responsibility.

Audit observations

Enhanced role and programmes of the CPCE

4.36 The CPCE conducted a review on its role and functions in September 2003. At its meeting held in November 2003, the CPCE agreed to promote the core civic values so as to build up a “Civil Society”. To enhance its role, the CPCE set up a working group to identify the core civic values and carry out research studies on corporate citizenship. The CPCE adopted the following long-term strategies for promoting civic education:

- (a) designating one or more selected themes each year to promote good civic values;
- (b) strengthening collaboration between the CPCE and district-based civic education committees to enhance promotion efforts; and
- (c) exploring how best to promote the concept of corporate citizenship with a view to enhancing the civic-mindedness of the business community and the working population.

4.37 In April 2004, the working group conducted a telephone survey on public knowledge and expectation of corporate citizenship. The working group organised a seminar on corporate citizenship in April 2005 to explore the best way to promote the concept of corporate citizenship.

Note 23: *Under the Community Participation Scheme, district bodies and community organisations were subsidised to organise civic education activities on promoting the selected theme of the year. The themes of 2004-05 and 2005-06 were “Social Participation and Commitment” and “Social Harmony” respectively. In 2004-05, the total subsidy for 155 successful applicants was \$3.8 million.*

Note 24: *The Resource Centre was established in 1989. Owing to its low utilisation, the CPCE planned to conduct a consultancy study to identify improvement measures.*

Tapping junior citizens' views on civic education

4.38 To draw on the ideas and insights of young people so as to find out the best way to reach out and educate their parents, peers and neighbours, the HAB worked closely with the Commission on Youth and major youth organisations in setting up district-based youth forums as standing platforms for young people to express views, and deliberate on issues of concern to the community at large. These youth forums would enable the Government to regularly tap the views of young people on civic education and other issues on a regular basis.

Civic and health education programmes for target groups

4.39 After the outbreak of SARS, a number of Announcements in the Public Interest and other programmes were developed to promote public hygiene. Based on Team Clean's recommendations, the following additional civic and health education programmes were organised under the theme of public hygiene for new arrivals, domestic helpers and users of public facilities:

- (a) ***New arrivals.*** The Department of Health developed an information kit for new arrivals on good hygiene practices and the penalties for public health offences. These free information kits were distributed at immigration control points. The HAB beefed up the section on personal and environmental hygiene in the publication "Your Guide to Services in Hong Kong". The HAD liaised with NGOs to run classes, and organised talks and seminars on good hygiene practices for new arrivals and their children;
- (b) ***Domestic helpers.*** To promote awareness among domestic helpers of the importance of maintaining a high standard of personal, home and community hygiene, the Department of Health distributed leaflets to remind them of the importance of cleanliness. The HAD engaged volunteers to launch promotional campaigns in areas with large gatherings of domestic helpers on Sundays and public holidays; and
- (c) ***Users of public facilities.*** The HAD deployed volunteers and youth workers employed under the Job Creation Programme (Note 25) to help educate the public about keeping the environment clean. The HAD also launched civic and health education projects during major festivals and in large-scale events. Participants handed out garbage bags and urged park users to clean up their rubbish, or take it home. Volunteers were mobilised to spread "keep clean" and "care for the environment" messages.

Note 25: *Since 2000, the Government has launched a series of job creation measures to tackle unemployment.*

Need to evaluate the effectiveness of district civic and health education programmes

4.40 Civic and health education programmes at the district level were mainly organised:

- (a) by NGOs with financial sponsorship under the Community Participation Scheme for promoting the CPCE's selected theme (such as "Social Harmony" in 2005-06); and
- (b) by the 18 DOs and often in collaboration with NGOs.

The civic and health education programmes are mainly talks, outreach projects and partnership projects with schools to promulgate civic awareness and responsibility. For the civic and health education programmes sponsored under the Community Participation Scheme, there is a designated sub-committee set up under the CPCE to administer and monitor the scheme. Members of the sub-committee monitor the implementation by participating in some activities of a selected number of projects to evaluate the effectiveness of the programmes. On completion of the projects, the programme organisers are required to submit to the CPCE Secretariat a project report setting out, among others, a self-assessment of the effectiveness of the programmes. The assessment takes into account the feedback obtained from the participants (by way of questionnaires) during the activities. The self-assessment report is considered alongside the comments made by CPCE members. **For other district civic and health education programmes organised by the DOs, Audit noted that there was no established procedure for the DOs to report the results of their programmes and the extent of community involvement to the HAB. In the absence of such information, the HAB could not evaluate the effectiveness of these programmes organised at the district level to facilitate the CPCE to plan its work on civic and health education.**

Need to solicit more NGOs' collaboration

4.41 NGOs have important roles to play in promoting civic responsibility in the community. Since August 2003, the 18 DOs, in partnership with NGOs, have launched tailor-made programmes (e.g. on prevention of SARS/dengue fever, anti-mosquito measures and establishment of OCs) to promulgate good hygiene practices for local residents, students, elderly, new arrivals, domestic helpers and other target groups.

4.42 The 18 DOs provide information about the civic and health education programmes in their monthly progress reports. The information included:

- (a) number of talks;

- (b) number of outreach projects;
- (c) number of partnership projects with schools; and
- (d) number of anti-littering/spitting operations.

4.43 Audit noted that 370 civic and health education programmes were organised by the 18 DOs in partnership with 271 NGOs during the 20-month period from August 2003 to March 2005. Details are given in Appendix G. Audit found that:

- (a) the number of programmes, organised in partnership with NGOs, varied significantly among the 18 districts, ranging from zero in Wong Tai Sin to 102 in Sha Tin; and
- (b) the number of NGOs involved varied significantly among the 18 districts, ranging from zero in Wong Tai Sin, Yuen Long and Islands to 127 in Tuen Mun.

4.44 Some DOs, in partnership with NGOs, organised only a relatively small number of civic and health education programmes during the period from August 2003 to March 2005. **In order to widen local community participation in civic and health education programmes, Audit considers that these DOs should work more closely with NGOs in the districts to promote civic responsibility in the local community at the district level.** Audit noted that in some districts, the number of NGOs involved (e.g. only one NGO in Wan Chai) was less than the number of programmes organised. As the number of participants in these civic and health education programmes was not available, Audit could not evaluate the extent of community involvement in these programmes. Audit noted that for the Tuen Mun District with the highest number of NGOs involved, schools were regarded as NGOs. **Audit considers that the HAD needs to establish proper procedures to ensure that the management information provided by the 18 DOs is compiled on a standardised and consistent basis.**

Audit recommendations

4.45 **Audit has recommended that:**

- (a) **the Secretary for Home Affairs should:**
 - (i) **in coordination with the Director of Home Affairs, devise a proper mechanism for the DOs to report to the HAB the evaluation results of the civic and health education programmes conducted at the**

district level and the extent of community involvement in these programmes; and

- (ii) **provide regularly to the CPCE the evaluation results of the civic and health education programmes conducted by the DOs at the district level to facilitate the CPCE to strategically plan its work on civic and health education; and**

(b) **the Director of Home Affairs should:**

- (i) **solicit the collaboration of NGOs to organise more civic and health education programmes to promote civic responsibility at the district level, particularly in those districts which have organised only a small number of programmes;**
- (ii) **encourage more NGOs of different sectors to participate in organising civic and health education programmes so as to widen local community participation; and**
- (iii) **evaluate regularly the extent of community involvement in civic and health education programmes with reference to the number of participants of these programmes.**

Response from the Administration

4.46 The **Secretary for Home Affairs** has said that he agrees in principle with the audit recommendations. He has also said that:

- (a) the DOs will be requested to report to the HAB the evaluation results of the civic and health education programmes and the extent of community involvement in these programmes; and
- (b) the HAB agrees to provide regularly to the CPCE the evaluation results of the civic and health education programmes conducted by the DOs at the district level.

4.47 The **Director of Home Affairs** has said that she agrees generally with the audit recommendations. She has also said that the HAD will engage more NGOs in organising more civic and health education activities. The DOs will also regularly review the extent of community involvement in these activities and report the evaluation results to the HAB.

Major activities of Keep Hong Kong Clean Campaign from 1970 to 1999

Decade	Major activities
1970s	<p>The major activities were as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) in December 1970, the Keep Hong Kong Clean Campaign Committee was set up. The publicity and educational activities officially commenced in August 1972. Posters were designed to enhance public awareness in cleaning Hong Kong. A number of mascots including the disgusting Litter Bug, the cute and lovely Miss Super Clean and the amiable bunny “Siu Pak To” were created. Activities were promoted through various media such as Announcements in the Public Interest on television and radio, and advertisements on trams, buses and the exterior of buildings with the participation of popular movie stars and artists in the publicity drive; (b) “Blitz” squads were set up to clear the litter blackspots in response to public complaints; (c) in 1973, the “Clean Our Buildings” campaign was held to encourage the public to join hands to clean up the environment; (d) 1975 was designated as the Year of Cleanliness with youngsters as the target of the publicity drive. An innovative activity was also launched to give awards to those who kept the environment clean if their efforts were captured on camera. The award winners’ photos were published in newspapers; (e) in 1976, the “Clean Living” exhibition was held at the City Hall to arouse public concern over environmental hygiene. The Picnic Warden Scheme was introduced to encourage picnickers and hikers to appoint one team member to take up the responsibility for cleaning up the refuse left behind by the whole team; (f) in 1978, the Auxiliary Litter Warden Scheme was implemented to make beaches cleaner; (g) in 1979, the publicity drive targeted the family as a whole, encouraging all family members to work together to keep Hong Kong clean; and (h) signs of “Rubbish Street” were put up in filthy streets where media reporting and photo-taking sessions were arranged in order to alert the public of the need to prevent littering.

Decade	Major activities
1980s	<p>The major activities were as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) from 1981 to 1984, the publicity design of a pair of furious eyes with the slogans “Hong Kong is Watching” or “A Clean City is a Healthy City” was used to remind the public to keep Hong Kong clean; (b) legislative amendments were made to increase the maximum penalty to a fine of \$5,000 and an imprisonment of six months; (c) in the mid-1980s, the theme of the Clean Hong Kong Campaign was changed to care and love. The logo featuring a “heart” design and the slogan “Everybody Loves a Clean Hong Kong” were printed on posters; (d) in 1987, to encourage the community to pitch in to keep the environment clean voluntarily, the promotion activities focused on community involvement. The Clean Hong Kong promotional theme song, “We are pitching in”, reminded the public to keep the environment clean; and (e) territory-wide large-scale clean-up activities (such as Clean Beach, Clean Countryside, Clean Harbour, Clean Estates and Clean Squatter Areas) were regularly launched.
1990s	<p>The major activities were as follows:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> (a) in 1992, the Keep Hong Kong Clean Campaign celebrated its 20th anniversary. Famous artists were invited to play the role of “Cleanliness Stars”; (b) in 1993, the Keep Hong Kong Clean Activities Funding Scheme was introduced to encourage district organisations or schools to mount clean-up operations through granting of subsidies. Funds were allocated to the then District Boards for organising various clean-up activities for people from all walks of life at the district level; and (c) territory-wide large-scale clean-up activities (such as Clean Beach, Clean Countryside, Clean Harbour, Clean Estates and Clean Squatter Areas) were regularly launched. The Dragon of Cleanliness, a healthy cartoon character, was introduced. The concept of “home” was the theme of the campaign. Some light-hearted community involvement activities (such as concerts, carnivals, roving exhibitions, tele-matches and variety shows) were also organised.

Source: FEHD records

**Cleansing exercises in the public housing estates
(January 2004 to March 2005)**

Quarter ended	Region					Total
	Kowloon East	Kowloon West and Hong Kong	Kwai Tsing, Tsuen Wan and Islands	Tai Po, North, Sha Tin and Sai Kung	Tuen Mun and Yuen Long	
(Number of cleansing exercises)						
2004						
March	3	12	6	5	11	37
June	7	4	1	6	3	21
September	1	1	–	–	2	4
December	4	5	1	–	1	11
2005						
March	–	16	6	–	5	27
Total	15	38	14	11	22	100

Source: HD records

Remarks: The cleansing exercises for the period from June 2003 to December 2003 were not included because the composition of estates in each region was different.

**Participation of Estate Management Advisory Committees and
non-government organisations in cleansing exercises in the public housing estates
(January 2004 to March 2005)**

Quarter ended	Region										Total	
	Kowloon East	Kowloon West and Hong Kong	Kwai Tsing, Tsuen Wan and Islands	Tai Po, North, Sha Tin and Sai Kung	Tuen Mun and Yuen Long							
(Number of EMACs and NGOs)												
	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO	EMAC	NGO
2004												
March	3	–	6	2	6	–	5	6	9	11	29	19
June	7	2	4	4	–	1	6	60	3	4	20	71
September	1	1	1	1	–	–	–	–	2	–	4	2
December	2	1	5	13	–	–	–	–	1	1	8	15
2005												
March	–	–	16	71	3	–	–	–	5	4	24	75
Total	13	4	32	91	9	1	11	66	20	20	85	182

Source: HD records

Remarks: The cleansing exercises for the period from June 2003 to December 2003 were not included because the composition of estates in each region was different.

**Participation of local residents and volunteers
in cleansing exercises in the public housing estates
(January 2004 to March 2005)**

Region

Quarter ended	Kowloon East		Kowloon West and Hong Kong		Kwai Tsing, Tsuen Wan and Islands		Tai Po, North, Sha Tin and Sai Kung		Tuen Mun and Yuen Long		Total	
	R	V	R	V	R	V	R	V	R	V	R	V
2004												
March	1,570	145	610	30	202	2	820	25	1,887	25	5,089	227
June	1,718	67	540	65	20	18	162	98	20	-	2,460	248
September	1,892	15	400	5	-	-	-	-	830	-	3,122	20
December	550	72	2,250	-	100	-	-	-	68	40	2,968	112
2005												
March	-	-	3,146	78	174	2	-	-	1,790	31	5,110	111
Total	5,730	299	6,946	178	496	22	982	123	4,595	96	18,749	718

*Legend: R denotes local residents
V denotes volunteers*

Source: HD records

Remarks: The cleansing exercises for the period from June 2003 to December 2003 were not included because the composition of estates in each region was different.

The Hong Kong Healthy Schools Award Scheme

1. If a school wants to join the Hong Kong Healthy Schools Award Scheme, it has to file an application with the CHEHP of the CUHK. Upon receipt of the application, the project team of the Award Scheme arranges a consultation meeting with the school coordinating body. The school coordinating body comprises the principal, teacher representatives, parents, governors, students and other staff. Two main criteria are used in the selection process. The participating schools should:

- (a) have a strong commitment to the development of health education; and
- (b) be broadly representative of different types, sizes, ethnic mixes and locations of schools.

2. It was planned that initially 50 schools would participate in the Award Scheme during the 2001-02 school year. These 50 schools would mainly be selected from those schools with trained school health educators and strong commitment from school administration. Another 50 schools were expected to enrol in the Award Scheme during the period from April 2002 to August 2004. These 50 schools would be of a more heterogeneous group from different parts of Hong Kong. Up to 31 August 2004, 101 schools joined the Award Scheme.

3. The Hong Kong Healthy Schools Award (the Award) is a three-tier award system with the Bronze, Silver and Gold Award status. All participating schools are assessed on the basis of the standards set by the World Health Organisation through a comprehensive school audit covering all six key areas (see para. 4.26). The measuring instrument adopted in the school audit consisted of a set of guidelines and standards with indicators developed by the world and local experts in health education and health promotion. For a particular level of award, the participating school must have achieved the required number of points on relevant items. Overseas experts in HPS joined the validation process of the audit. They accompanied the audit team of the CHEHP of the CUHK on their accreditation visits to gain a good understanding of the schools, and held meetings to discuss the results of school audit and review the rating systems with the audit team of the CHEHP of the CUHK. Up to 30 June 2005, 63 schools went through the audit. Of these, 3 (or 5%) schools were presented with the Gold Award, 21 (or 33%) schools were presented with the Silver Award and 29 (or 46%) schools were presented with the Bronze Award. Another 17 schools will be audited in the 2005-06 school year.

4. According to the CHEHP of the CUHK, the Award Scheme would:

For schools

- (a) improve students' performance in academic and non-academic areas;
- (b) promote the school's ethos positively;
- (c) involve the whole school community and strengthen links among parents, principal, school staff, students, governors and community partners;

For students

- (d) achieve better academic results within a setting that supports their health and well-being;
- (e) gain access to a wide range of support services and add value to their personal and social development;
- (f) become more confident, more motivated and creative and have the skills and information to make important life and health choices, hence assuming greater control of their own future;

For the community

- (g) produce physically and mentally healthy young people who could contribute to the community with their best, and become good citizens; and
- (h) form closer ties with the schools and provide them with the necessary support.

Appendix G
(para. 4.43 refers)

**Civic and health education programmes organised by District Offices
(August 2003 to March 2005)**

District	Number of talks (a)	Number of outreach projects (b)	Number of partnership projects with schools (c)	Number of anti-littering/spitting operations (d)	Number of programmes (e) = (a) + (b) + (c) + (d)	Number of NGOs
Wong Tai Sin	–	–	–	–	–	–
Yuen Long	2	–	–	–	2	–
Islands	–	1	3	–	4	–
Central & Western	1	1	1	1	4	1
Wan Chai	24	–	–	13	37	1
Sham Shui Po	2	–	–	–	2	2
Yau Tsim Mong	2	1	–	–	3	3
Tai Po	2	8	9	–	19	5
Kowloon City	23	–	1	6	30	5
North	2	1	–	2	5	6
Tsuen Wan	10	6	1	12	29	9
Sha Tin	20	6	23	53	102	9
Eastern	–	2	–	1	3	11
Southern	10	9	6	2	27	12
Kwai Tsing	4	2	2	–	8	19
Sai Kung	18	1	–	1	20	22
Kwun Tong	32	2	–	–	34	39
Tuen Mun	9	20	7	5	41	127 (Note)
Total	161	60	53	96	370	271

Source: HAD records

Note: Schools were regarded as NGOs in Tuen Mun.

Acronyms and abbreviations

AC	Area Committee
Audit	Audit Commission
CCTV	Closed-circuit television
CHEHP	Centre for Health Education and Health Promotion
CPCE	Committee on the Promotion of Civic Education
CUHK	Chinese University of Hong Kong
CYC	Community Youth Club
DC	District Council
DCHKC	District Clean Hong Kong Committee
DHS	District Hygiene Squads
DO	District Office
EDAS	Estate Drainage Ambassadors Scheme
EMAC	Estate Management Advisory Committee
EMB	Education and Manpower Bureau
ESR	External School Review
FEHD	Food and Environmental Hygiene Department
FPN	Fixed penalty notice
HAB	Home Affairs Bureau
HAD	Home Affairs Department
HD	Housing Department
HPS	Health Promoting School
MAC	Mutual Aid Committee
NGO	Non-government organisation
OC	Owners' Corporation
PHE	Public housing estate
PTA	Parent-Teacher Association
QEF	Quality Education Fund
SARS	Severe Acute Respiratory Syndrome